

# WYOMING COUNTY - WESTSIDE SCHOOL PROJECT PROJECT LABOR AGREEMENT CASE STUDY

	<u>Bids w/ PLA</u>	<u>Bids w/o PLA</u>
Package 1 - General construction	Wiseman \$9,320,000 Neighborgall \$9,950,000	<b>Radford \$8,302,000</b> <b>TMARO \$9,151,000</b> Wiseman \$9,456,000
Package 2 - Plumb, Mech, HVAC	Harris Bros \$1,950,000 Lowe Bros \$1,975,000 Daugherty \$1,990,000	<b>Darnold \$1,710,364</b> Daugherty \$1,879,400 Harris \$1,949,055 Lowe Bros \$1,902,068 <b>Al Marino \$2,138,008</b>
Package 3 - Electrical	Lowe Bros \$1,225,000 Progressive \$1,259,000 Summit \$1,350,000	K&W \$1,075,730 Lowe Bros \$1,140,913 <b>Master Service \$1,159,700</b> <b>Tri County \$1,198,000</b> Progressive \$1,212,300 Summit \$1,230,899
Package 4 - Fire Protection	Brewer \$173,915	Brewer \$173,355
Package 5 - Kitchen Equip (No PLA on this package)	Hooten \$221,000	Hooten \$221,000
<b>TOTAL ESTIMATED COST OF WESTSIDE HIGH SCHOOL</b>	<b>\$12,889,915</b>	<b>\$11,482,449</b>
<b>TOTAL BIDS RECEIVED #1-4</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>15 (67% Increase in bids)</b>
<b>TOTAL COST SAVING W/O PLA</b>	<b>\$1,407,466</b>	<b>11% Decrease in cost</b>

Bold = ABCWV Member

*Thanks to all the ABC members who wrote letters, made phone calls, and attended meetings.*  
**ABC...WORKING FOR YOU!**

The Associated Press State & Local Wire

The materials in the AP file were compiled by The Associated Press. These materials may not be republished without the express written consent of The Associated Press.

December 20, 2000, Wednesday, BC cycle

SECTION: State and Regional

LENGTH: 226 words

HEADLINE: New Wyoming County school to be rebid

DATELINE: PINEVILLE, W.Va.

BODY:

Construction contracts for a new high school in Wyoming County will be rebid without a project labor agreement that would have required union labor be used on the project.

Wyoming County Board of Education members voted 4-1 Monday to rebid the general trades contract without the agreement after initial bids came in more than \$1.5 million over estimates.

About \$7.9 million is budgeted for the general trades portion of the project. The lowest bid came in at \$9.5 million, said construction manager Mike Osmond.

"I believe that the labor agreement had a negative impact on the number of bids as well as the dollar amount of each bid," Osmond said.

Westside High is scheduled to consolidate students attending Baileysville and Oceana high schools in the fall of 2002. Rebidding the project is expected to delay the project about 45 days, but will not impact the opening of the school, school officials said.

The state School Building Authority awarded Wyoming County nearly \$6 million last year to build Westside High, contingent upon passage of a bond issue.

Voters approved a \$7 million school construction bond Feb. 26, with \$5 million earmarked for construction of Westside and \$1 million each for outdoor athletic facilities at both Westside and Wyoming County East High, which opened in 1998.

## **PROJECT LABOR AGREEMENT CASE STUDY WYOMING COUNTY WESTSIDE HIGH SCHOOL**

On February 26, 2000, the voters of Wyoming County, West Virginia approved a \$7 million bond for the construction of the new Westside High School. On May 8, the board of education approved a union-only Project Labor Agreement for this job. It was believed that the board of education agreed to this deal in exchange for the union's help in getting the school bond passed.

After many delays, the board was ready to accept bids, to be opened on December 12, 2000. Merit shop contractors decided to submit protest letters in lieu of bids. The Wyoming County Board of Education ended up with a total of 10 bids for five separate packages. They also received 16 protest letters.

Of the five bid packages, four were covered by the PLA: (1) general construction, (2) plumbing, mechanical, HVAC, (3) Electrical, (4) Fire Protection. The fifth package was for kitchen equipment. When the bids were opened, Wyoming County received two bids for general construction, three for plumbing, three for electrical, and one for fire protection, all of which were over budget by a total of more than \$1.5 million.

On 12/18/00, the board held another meeting to decide what to do. Merit shop contractors were on hand and convinced board members to re-bid without the PLA.

When the new bid results came in, Wyoming County received three bids for general construction, five for plumbing, six for electrical, and still only one for fire protection. It may only be a coincidence that packages 1-3 came in under budget, and package 4 was the only one over budget. Packages 1-3 were awarded to merit shop contractors, who saved the taxpayers of Wyoming County and West Virginia over \$1.4 million.

	<b>WITH PLA</b>	<b>WITHOUT PLA</b>	<b>DIFFERENCE</b>
<b>NUMBER OF BIDS</b>	9	15	67% INCREASE
<b>COST</b>	\$12,889,915	\$11,482,449	11% DECREASE

It should be noted that this project was covered under state prevailing wage statutes. Labor costs and school construction plans were identical—the only difference was the project labor agreement.